

"B. 194"

COMMENTS AND CRITICISMS OF STUDENT OFFICERS
ON COURSE AT THE ARMY INDUSTRIAL COLLEGE
February - June, 1925.

-oOo-

GENERAL:

"I consider the course at the Army Industrial College excellent for the purpose of training branch procurement officers for duties in planning for war and for procurement during war.

The Army differs from the Navy in that it has eight separate supply branches instead of one, and that procurement is largely decentralized instead of centralized. For this reason it is advisable to train officers of these various supply branches of the Army in the plans, duties and responsibilities of the office of the Assistant Secretary of War - in supervising and coordinating the procurement of the eight supply branches of the Army with the Navy, other executive departments, super-agencies if formed, and with civilian industries in case of war."

Capt. J. R. Defrees, U.S.N.

-oOo-

"I have no suggestion to offer relative to the Administration of the College as it seems to me that the present methods and plan of operation are entirely satisfactory.

One suggestion that seems to me advisable would be to distribute to the branch chiefs and the corps areas studies turned in by the student officers. This action would tend to disseminate information and the work of the Army Industrial College."

Col. W. A. Dempsey, QM-ORC.

-oOo-

"I wish to express my appreciation of the opportunity to attend the course just ending.

It has afforded an opportunity to become acquainted with the tremendous problems of the procurement of supplies that confronts the Army if it should become involved in an emergency.

It has been a great pleasure to be associated with the officers of a sister service and to know that they are bringing such enthusiasm and hard work to the solution of the procurement problems.

There is no criticism, constructive or otherwise, that I feel able to offer. The course certainly has covered the ground thoroughly and capably and has given a comprehensive ground work for the officers taking it to understand the problems that are likely to arise in a war.

Cmdr. D.J. Cather, M.C., U.S.N.

195

"The Army Industrial College, even though young and as yet little known to a large majority of our military personnel, occupies an important place in our military educational system. There is great need in the Army for the class of training given in this college and not the least of its missions is to enable us to avoid the error of thinking of tactical training as the one real essential in the education of military men.

I believe the number of students should be greater because at the present rate it will take too long to obtain a proper and substantial distribution of officers with this training throughout the Army. The officers who have had this training understand and appreciate the importance of this and the quicker we can "sell" that idea to the Army the better."

Maj. D. B. Netherwood, A.S.

-oOo-

"My original views, upon which I based my letter for permission to attend this college, have not changed. The instruction given was much needed and has served as a sound foundation for further education along this and other military subjects that I shall continue, with or without as capable instructors as has been my good fortune here."

Maj. H. F. Cameron, C.E.

-oOo-

"All officers detailed to duty in supply branches or procurement districts should, so far as practicable, be required to complete the course.

The personnel of the Procurement Planning Branch of the Office of the Assistant Secretary of War should be selected from the graduates of the school.

Officers completing the course should be required to serve at least one year on procurement or associated supply duty."

Capt. S. E. Nortner, C.E.

-oOo-

FACULTY COMMENT:

No comment on above.

-oOo-

COURSE, GENERAL:

"The weak link in the course is that it does not provide adequate and definite instructions for proper coordination of the various branch district chiefs within the separate procurement districts. There may be eight district chiefs in one procurement district, working more or less independently of each other, limited only by allocations. Coordination of effort should extend from the top down through all units."

Capt. J. R. Defrees, U.S.N.

-oOo-

"The work of the course has proved very interesting and instructive and forms a basis, for an officer who so wills, upon which he may build up much knowledge on a subject whose importance is unquestionable."

Lt.Col. R. T. Ellis, Q.M.C.

-oOo-

"I consider the course an excellent one in that the student gains a broad and general understanding of the necessity and purpose of preparedness planning and the organization necessary to carry out these plans. Through contact with each other, especially in committee work where branch policies and problems are discussed, students become advocates of closer cooperation between the supply branches and between the Army and the Navy."

Lt.Col. C. R. Reese, Q.M.C.

-oOo-

"The course given by the Army Industrial College is an excellent one. A student gains a comprehensive view of the great and complex problems involved in war time procurement and industrial mobilization that is valuable. As many officers as practicable - from all branches of the service - should be given the opportunity of taking it."

Cmdr. L.W. Jennings, S.C., U.S.N.

-oOo-

"In general, I have found the course intensely interesting and instructive, and the subjects covered such as will enable an officer to be better qualified to perform duty of a procurement nature either in Washington or branch offices in the field."

Lt.Col. W. C. Baker, C.W.S.

-oOo-

"The course as it stands is an excellent one and is, without doubt, a great benefit to all who take it."

Maj. A. G. Gutensohn, S.C.

-oOo-

"The course should begin with a study of well prepared papers which do reflect the views of the office of the Assistant Secretary of War. Papers now presented reflect the views of a committee or of an individual. They may or may not reflect the views of the Assistant Secretary of War. The net result is that no doctrines are taught and a student takes away only what he thinks is correct. Standardized and proper methods will never result until certain approved studies are taught as part of the curriculum."

Maj. C.A. Schimelfenig, Ord.

-oOo-

"Before suggesting changes, I desire to first commend the course as at present carried on. I have found the course very interesting and instructive. Without exaggeration, I can say that this course has been the most pleasant school duty I have been on during my military service. It has opened up a new field of interest in service activities; it has given me a broader idea of the difficulties, problems and duties of the branches other than my own; it has taught me, in a general way at least, what the procurement problem in war time is; it has created a curiosity to learn more about a number of things that I did not have an opportunity to while pursuing the course to thoroughly delve into; has changed some rather fixed but erroneous ideas of mine on the relations between the material and man power problems of the War Department; and, lastly, it has given me an opportunity to make intimate friends among some earnest, hardworking and deep thinking officers outside my own branch."

Maj. Ira A. Rader, A.S.

-oOo-

"I have found the present course of the Army Industrial College extremely interesting as it has opened up lines of thought and endeavor essential to the successful prosecution of a war, which I admit have never before occurred to me, my service being in the "using" end of the game rather than in the "supply" end.

One particularly valuable feature of the course is that of the close association of men who will be charged in their individual services with similar duties. This will result in beneficial relations in their later service."

Maj. S. W. Fitzgerald, A.S.

-oOo-

"An attempt has been made throughout the course to find a principle of procurement equivalent to the principle of "offensive" in tactics, and it is believed that the principle of "timely accomplishment" comes nearest to meeting this requirement. In other words, it is apparent that any procurement activity, decision, or regulation is correct only insofar as it facilitates timely accomplishment and that every other principle or consideration can be subordinated to that principle."

Maj. R. L. Maxwell, Ord.

-oOo-

"In general, it is my opinion that the course has been well conducted and productive of exhaustive and carefully developed solutions of the problems presented. I have no criticisms of the field covered in the time allotted, but desire to submit a few suggestions which would, I believe, make the course even more valuable to the student officers."

Capt. E.E. MacMorland, Ord.

-oOo-

"The system of instruction consisting of lectures, committee work, and individual studies is very satisfactory. If the course is lengthened as recommended above, the proportion of individual studies should be increased.

Considering the limited time available for the present course, I feel that it has accomplished its mission very well indeed, and I think that all the students consider that their time has been well spent."

Lieut. H. W. Rowan, C.W.S.

-oOo-

"It is my opinion that the course has been extremely valuable and will be very profitable to any officer in the supply branches.

It is believed that the suggestions enumerated would be of some value in improving the present course; however, even if none are adopted, the course will be - as it has been - very valuable and desirable from the viewpoint of officers in supply branches."

Capt. S. E. Norther, C.E.

-oOo-

FACULTY COMMENT:

No comment on above.

-oOo-

COURSE, LENGTH OF:

"I have found that the time allotted for some problems was too short to permit a complete study of references and the preparation of a complete paper as I desired to submit. I think that the course could well be lengthened to cover a school year - the same as the Army War College or the Command and General Staff School, and the time added utilized by lengthening the period allotted to problems requiring extensive research, more officers assigned to specific subjects, and additional subjects taken up in the course."

Lt.Col. W. C. Baker, C.W.S.

-oOo-

"Extend the time allowed for the course to nine months".

-oOo-

Maj. A.G. Gutensohn, S.C.

"My recommendations for changes revolve around one main recommendation. THE COURSE SHOULD BE LENGTHENED TO ONE YEAR. I do not see how the present course can be very much improved unless lengthened. As it is, the student gets a good general idea of the problem connected with industrial preparedness, but there are so many vital details that he cannot possibly get in the short space of five months. Assuming that the course is lengthened to ten months or one year, I would add the following recommendations.

The course should be parallel that of the War College as far as possible, and the class should attend important lectures there."
Maj. I. A. Rader, A.S.

-oOo-

"The method of conducting the course with a view to bringing out and developing new ideas is excellent. The course should be longer and the number of students should be very much greater.

I believe the course should be longer for the following reasons:

- (a) The great problem of industrial mobilization offers plenty of material for a longer course.
- (b) Placing the length of the course on a par with those of the Army War College and the General Service School would emphasize the importance of the college and there seems to be a definite need for such emphasis.
- (c) The addition of some basic instruction concerning psychology in business and how best to establish and maintain friendly relations with civilian industrial leaders would be of great value. The average military man needs such training to enable him to deal successfully with civilians.
- (d) Having the course run from September to the following June would fit in better with the present War Department policy regarding change of station of officers."

Maj. D. B. Netherwood, A.S.

-oOo-

"It is thought that the course should be lengthened and more time devoted to commodity studies and the preparation of specific war plans. At least two commodity studies should be prepared by each student, one rather simple and the second more complicated. Also, at least two studies on procurement of specific items should be made by each student. During the past course the time allowed (one week) for the preparation of the procurement plan for specific item and the commodity study (two weeks) was not sufficient to permit the student to thoroughly digest the subject matter and obtain a full appreciation of importance of the subject."

Maj. R. W. Riefkohl, Q.M.C.

-oOo-

"To do most of the things suggested in the preceding paragraphs, it would be necessary to lengthen the school term to a full academic

year corresponding with the War College. "here is plenty to do and a full course would not only be of great value to the student officer, but would enhance the prestige of the school. Short courses have the appearance of "get rich quick" schemes and detract from that reputation so necessary to establish if the school is to fill its greatest need. Then too, the short course is hardly in keeping with the name of "college"."

Maj. J. L. Frink, Q.M.C.

-oOo-

"To put the course on a parity with the War College, it should be lengthened to one year. It may be better to await the graduation of the first group of officers from the Harvard Business School before doing this. These officers will come prepared to act as instructors in economics and other basic subjects."

Capt. E. E. MacMorland, Ord.

-oOo-

"The course should be increased to a full academic year."

Capt. S. E. Nortner, C.E.

-oOo-

"The length of the course, however, counteracts this advantage to some extent, in that the individual student, during the course, touches upon a few only of the subjects brought before the school. He does, of course, hear the solutions of many of the problems by other members of the class, and once having heard a solution is aware that the information is available, should he have reason to refer to it, but the intimate knowledge he has gained from his own solutions is lacking and since his own problems usually deal with subjects relating to his own particular branch he loses part of the advantages to be gained from the course in learning to appreciate the fact that his own branch is one only of seven which must work in harmony under stress of emergency conditions."

Capt. W. J. Henry, Ord.

-oOo-

"The length of the course should be increased to a full academic year of nine months. Studies should be made by each member of the class on all matters of general importance, such as Power, Labor, Capital, Transportation, Standardization, etc. The weekly conferences and the publications of studies made by other members of the class do not make up for the lack of actual work done. It is, of course, impossible to accomplish this with the present length of the course."

Lieut. H.W. Rowan, C.W.S.

-oOo-

FACULTY COMMENT:

The Faculty Board agrees with the general opinion that the course should be lengthened to a full academic year.

-c0c-

COURSE, SCOPE OF:

"If the supply branches can be induced to formulate and present to the college for study some of their actual procurement problems, in detail, and these be worked out by the student officers of the respective interested corps, this would have much constructive value. In addition, it would very probably arouse a lively and sympathetic interest in the college and help to advertise its work and popularize its aims.

If, in a similar way, the sympathetic assistance of the Bureau of Supplies and Accounts and the Navy Section of the Army and Navy Munitions Board can be enlisted, and some studies of actual special naval problems be carried out by the Naval student officers attached to the college, the value of the course will be enhanced.

I would like to see, too, some extension of the course that would make it attractive to members of the Reserve Supply Corps of the Navy. I am not, however, qualified by experience to add any suggestions as to how to attain this end. As to the length of the course (i.e. five months at present with sessions of two a year) it seems to me that, in its present state of the collegē, this should remain unchanged."

Capt. E. Snow, C.C., U.S.N.

-c0c-

"That a study of the procurement problems of our other wars, as well as the World War, be made and presented to the student. The information contained in General Gorgas' report on the Ordnance Department of the Confederacy leads me to think that possibly such a study would develop basic principles of procurement in time of war that might modify or substantiate those evolved from the studies made of procurement in the World War."

Maj. L. B. McAfee, M.C.

-c0c-

"Devoting some portion of the course to actual observation of the activities of industrial organizations."

Maj. R. L. Maxwell, Ord.

-c0c-

202

"Inasmuch as considerable of the American policy in economic and industrial control during the World War came about largely as a result of the experience of the Allies and the Central Powers, it would seem advantageous to include more of the history of such foreign experiences as the course progresses."

Maj. J. L. Frink, QM.C.

-oOo-

"Concerning new problems, I would suggest that at least two more individual problems be devised covering the organization and method of operation of civilian industry, one problem covering the administration and operation of government manufacturing plants, and one problem developing what should be included in factory war plans. Business Economics should be one of the principal subjects in an expanded course. A part of the year should be devoted to practical experience for the student officers in large industrial concerns. Ordnance officers could, for example, go to the General Electric Co., or Warner-Swasey for two or three months; Quartermaster to Sears-Roebuck; Signal to Western Electric; Chemical Warfare to the General Chemical Co., etc."

Majt. E. E. MacMorland, Ord.

-oOo-

"Subject Matter. It is believed that some subjects have been, or may become, exhausted and that future problems on such subjects should be limited to criticism of the theories or reasoning incorporated in solutions previously presented. Conservation seems to be one of these subjects."

Capt. S. E. Norther, C.E.

-oOo-

"In general, the ground covered by the course is entirely satisfactory. It is believed, however, that more time could properly be spent on the work of the Assistant Secretary's office. The present course apparently stresses the work of the procurement branches at the expense of that of the Assistant Secretary's office. This could easily be avoided.

The present course consists not only of instruction but a considerable amount of research work is also done by each student. This is an excellent idea.

More time should be spent, if possible, on the studies of Industrial Organization, Planning, and Control. A visit should be made to the DuPont Company or other similar large industries.

Too much time was spent during the past course on the preparation of the Procurement Manual. The class received very little instruction or benefit from this work. Work of this kind should be done by officers on duty in the Assistant Secretary's office and not by students of the College.

Non-commercial finished products should not be assigned as subjects

for commodity studies. They do not give student any practice in the use of reference libraries or other general sources of information. The entire information is usually contained in one pamphlet or folder in the technical files of the student's own branch.

Lieut. H. W. Rowan, C.W.S.

-c0c-

FACULTY COMMENT:

It is proposed to change the scope of the course gradually so as to omit subjects that are more or less well worked out and include in their place subjects which have not had sufficient attention heretofore. This is the best that can be done until a greater length of time is available for the course. Among the subjects under consideration for inclusion at an appropriate time are:

- Procurement in Great Britain during the World War;
- Procurement in France during the World War;
- Procurement in Germany during the World War;
- Procurement in the Southern Confederacy during the Civil War.

Additional time will be devoted to organization in modern industry. While the Procurement Manual is an excellent piece of work, it is planned to have it reviewed briefly by a small committee of the Fourth Class before issuing it.

-c0c-

COURSE, DONDUCT OF:

"Each student is at present allowed absolute freedom of thought even though the result is diametrically opposed to the existing policies of the office of the Assistant Secretary of War. This, of course, results in a great many original ideas and in the attack of a problem from every conceivable angle. On the other hand, the result is not one that the Assistant Secretary of War can publish to the services as a policy of his office.

On account of the limited number of officer personnel on duty in the office of the Assistant Secretary of War, and on account of the magnitude of the task in preparing the plans for the mobilization of industry, it is believed that by lengthening the time of the course and by making more direct use of the students, the publication of the industrial plans and policies could be expedited without sacrificing the educational value of the school.

Since three classes have now covered the same general ground, it is thought that sufficient data has been accumulated to justify the school in adopting a policy of "controlled thought".

The first half of the course be devoted to a study of the duties of the Assistant Secretary of War and chiefs of branches in connection with the mobilization of industry and their relation to the General Staff. For the first year or two this work could be done by student committees with

204

the results written up as chapters of a future texts such as the procurement manual now being prepared.

The last half of the course to be devoted to studies of plans and policies which the Assistant Secretary of War desires to publish to the services.

The work of the last half of the term to be carried out by committees, the chairman being the head of the division or section of the office of the Assistant Secretary of War to which the plan or policy pertains, the other members being students.

The chairman should not do the work but merely direct the work of the students so the product will be in keeping with the policies and instructions previously published. This will result in a product that the Assistant Secretary of War can use without a complete re-study."

Maj. A. G. Gutensohn, S.C.

-c0c-

"That the completed committee studies be given to members of the class at least one day in advance of the date set for the report of the committee, in order that each member of the class may study the report and thus be prepared for its discussion. This will insure intelligent discussion and will enable members of the class to gain a knowledge of the subject of the report unobtainable in any other way."

Maj. Fred Seydel, C.W.S.

-c0c-

"The present system requiring no competitive marks or grades is to be commended. It is to be presumed that the officers who will be detailed to take this course are earnest, intelligent and conscientious and that they need no spur in order to obtain their best efforts. Any competitive marking system would tend, in my opinion, to make the students strive to express ideas in the solution of their problems which they believe would be most acceptable to the faculty rather than to express new and constructive ideas of their own. In my mind, this college has not as yet reached a stage where "water tight" principles can be laid down. Some of the problems attacked are more or less new. Out of the many ideas that will be expressed by the students at this college there will probably be at least a few very good ones that can be used. Hence, the present system of allowing and encouraging students to give free expression to their own ideas should be continued."

Maj. Ira A. Rader, A. S.

-c0c-

"It is considered pertinent to comment upon the advantages of the course to the individual officer, making particular reference to the following features of the Army Industrial College course in its present form:

The course as conducted at present does not foster or permit individual competition.

A student officer is given an opportunity to visualize procurement problems of branches other than his own.

The amount of committee work required by the course gives practice in team work which is very essential to the staff officer whatever his assignment."

Maj. R. L. Maxwell, Ord.

-oOo-

"The committee problems that I have been connected with did not give the instruction that the others did. Generally this has been due to the lack of a proper directive and work order by the chairman. An additional week could be used both by the chairman in securing the faculty approval of the directive and the work order, while the members can be reading the references cited that they can plan their work better. Coordination and cooperation in this should make for better papers, as well as add to the enthusiasm of the student."

Maj. H.F. Cameron, C.E.

-oOo-

"For a number of years to come limit the attendance to the field grades.

It also seems to me that if more time could be given to individuals and committees in the preparation of studies, particularly commodity studies, their work might be of some value other than academic and contribute in full measure to the planning work of the branches. As an example, Major Gardiner and the writer spent about ten days on "Hides and Leather". In such a short time it is evident that only experts could prepare a study of any great value for war time use. If, however, a month had been available to work this up, it would have been possible to produce a study that would well be accepted by the Quartermaster General office as a basis for the actual work of that branch.

Personally, the writer thinks that a still higher grade of committee work would result if the chairman of each committee was furnished with an advance copy of the committee problem about two weeks prior to the date set for the committee to begin work. This would enable the chairman to plan the work of the committee, outline a method of treatment for presentation to the committee, assemble the necessary data, authorities and references, which sometimes takes nearly two weeks. For example, the historical monograph on Price Control, prepared by a committee during this course, and accepted by the Faculty as a worthwhile contribution, was the result of such advance information. This permitted the work to be laid out before hand and references secured for all committee members and resulted in the maximum use of time available to the committee for the actual work of preparation."

Maj. J.L. Frink, Q.M.C.

-oOo-

"It is my opinion that there should be less committee work and more individual problems. Individual problems keep the students busier than does committee work. Often committee studies are also the work of one member. If all members write parts of the report, continuity of thought and arrangement are often lost. Committee work can be made valuable if each problem analyses the phases and assigns a definite phase to each member.

It is suggested that all routine lectures by instruction personnel be scheduled for 9:30 A.M. and feature lectures for 11:00 A.M. The early hour obviates having the day broken up at 11 A.M. except for a feature lecture.

The Saturday conferences are somewhat tedious at times. It is suggested that each paper be limited to a ten minute abstract and that all students receive copies of the entire paper afterwards."

Capt. E.E. MacMorland, Ord.

-oOo-

"It would be advisable to have more conferences on solutions presented, but not in a single period. It might be satisfactory to require all solutions completed by Saturday, then present one solution a day in conference each day of the following week.

Regardless of the length of typewritten solutions of a problem, no problem should be allowed more than 45 minutes in conference.

Facilities. Students may be handicapped in their work by the lack of clerical personnel in that branches do not always recognize the necessity of assigning personnel to do this school work. It is believed that at least one stenographer in each branch should be required to give preference to the work of students in the Army Industrial College. It is thought that this may best be accomplished by the direct assignment of a stenographer for this purpose.

Capt. S. E. Nortner, C.E.

-oOo-

"In general, the course has been entirely satisfactory and, in particular, the method of carrying out the instruction which requires the student to depend upon his own initiative largely after having been given a brief directive, is, it is believed, an excellent means of training the student in what may become his actual duty in the office of the Assistant Secretary of War."

Capt. W. J. Henry, Ord.

-oOo-

"The practice of taking no action on papers published should be discontinued. When each paper is published it should contain the opinion of the Industrial College. This opinion should start off something as follows: "this paper meets with the approval of the Army Industrial College with the following exceptions:". If the paper does not meet

207

with the approval of the Industrial College, with certain minor exceptions, it should not be published at all."

Lieut. N.W. Rowan, C.W.S.

-oOo-

"I would recommend that where a number of young officers are members of a class, they be distributed as members of groups of officers of higher rank and greater experience, rather than being placed by themselves, grouped according to rank.

Capt. W. J. Henry, Ord.

-oOo-

"The school year should be increased to at least ten months.

The work should be divided as follows: first half year to be devoted to research and study; the second half to be devoted to the working of such problems as may be assigned.

The study period (first half year) should be divided into two periods: two months to be devoted to the study of basic mobilization plan and other phases of the General Staff point of view; three months to be devoted to the study of supply and industrial problems.

A definite system of lectures should be arranged for the entire school year.

Every effort should be made to have student officers consider all problems from the viewpoint of the Army as a whole, and not as problems of their own branches.

With the exception of the above, the school should be continued along present lines as it is felt that it has fulfilled its mission in the short space of time allotted."

Lieut. C. W. Steinmetz, A.S.

-oOo-

"The officers of the Planning Branch should be used more on problems coming within the purview of their duty; that is, such subjects when assigned to the students should come under the direct supervision of the officer assigned to duty in the Planning Branch. Informal conferences at the time the assignment is given by this officer would help to orient students in the solution of the problems."

Capt. S. E. Norther, C.E.

-oOo-

FACULTY COMMENT:

The Faculty is inclined to adhere to its previous policy of encouraging entire freedom of thought. The use of so-called "approved solutions" would be most unwise. At best, they represent but the opinion of an individual which may be no better than the student's. In many

cases it is impossible to know, in advance, of the event what action would be taken in time of war. For instance, the actual set up of super agencies will be determined by the President of the United States at the time of the emergency. The best the War Department can do is to have a clear conception of what was done during the last war and what might be done with propriety during the next one. It can have no adequate knowledge of and no proper concern with the political considerations which will inevitably enter into the solution of the problem.

The provision of sufficient clerical personnel in the College to take care of the individual requirements of the student officers would require a large force. Officers at the War College are obliged to arrange for such work themselves and it is undesirable to do otherwise in the Industrial College. If it is decided to have such work done by the officer's own branch, branch chiefs should arrange to take care of his student officers by giving them priority on the time of one or two typists. In this way it is believed that all the needs of the situation would be met and with a minimum of expense.

-oOo-

FACULTY:

"The officers in charge of the school work have been most patient and painstaking in answering questions and in making available all possible sources of information needed by the students."

Maj. I.A. Rader, A.S.

-oOo-

"I desire to take this opportunity of expressing my appreciation of the extremely pleasant relations maintained by the Faculty in the conduct of the school course and their individual interest and helpful attention toward any question brought to their attention. I feel that the course just ending will prove of great benefit to me in the conduct of the work which will be assigned me - Procurement officer for the Air Service."

Maj. S.W. Fitzgerald A.S.

-oOo-

"I desire to express my appreciation for the courtesy and helpful faculty suggestions given me during the course. If I have not met your expectations as a student, the fault is not yours. I can say that the course has given me larger and broader views of the long road that still stretches out ahead of the office of the Assistant Secretary of War; it has fitted me to help more intelligently in putting thru the objective of this office; and has taught me to recognize more clearly the coordinating agencies of the units of the Army, Navy and Federal Government and the civilian agencies that must all work in unison at all times."

Maj. H.F. Cameron, C.E.

-oOo-

"The number of officers on the faculty should be sufficiently large to permit of detailed criticism of solutions presented."

Capt. S.E. Nortner, C.E.

-oOo-

FACULTY COMMENT:

No comment is offered.

-oOo-

ORIENTATION:

"The three orientation problems given at the outset, with their numerous references, appeal to me as being of much value in laying the foundation for the general, specific and applied problems which follow. A fourth orientation problem could, I think, be advantageously added.

The problem I have in mind is that of requiring the students to post themselves as to the sources and kind of information that is available in other branches of the Government. I feel that most of us know too little about our near neighbors life work and that knowing where or upon whom to call for data and assistance in this problem of procurement will be of considerable value.

The problem I have to suggest would run somewhat like this:

Problem No. ____ . Orientation: The correlated work of the Departments of the Navy, Commerce, Interior, Labor, Treasury and Agriculture as affects mass procurement.

References: Lecture on Mass Procurement, by the Asst. Secretary of War, January 30, 1923; the Navy as an Industrial Asset; The Congressional Directory - Points dealing with the functions of the Executive Departments, their divisions and sections; Use your own Government, by Allisa-Franc; latest list of Inter Dept. Ec. Liaison Committees; a list of the more important statistical publications inspired by these departments: (1) Annual report of the Paymaster General of the Navy; (2) Statistical abstract of the U.S., etc.; (3) Year books of Depts of Commerce and Agriculture.

Requirement: A comprehensive yet terse and succinct statement of the kind and sources of information (bearing on procurement) that may be had from other executive departments. To close with a study of how to correlate the information thus available to the work of the Assistant Secretary of War as relates to National Defense."

Capt. E. Snow, C.C., U.S.N./

O-oOo-O

"Prior to the preparation of the first problem, "Orientation", lectures should be given by a member of the General Staff, an officer of the O.A.S.W. and by representatives of the supply branches. The subject matter of these lectures to cover the field of action and responsibility of the General Staff, the office of the Assistant Secretary of War and the supply branches in matters pertaining to procurement. These lectures being given before, or during the time the student is preparing his study on orientation, it is believed will give him a better grasp of the subject."

Maj. R. W. Riefkohl, Q.M.C.

-oOo-

"I haven't any comment or criticism on the general plan of conducting the course and believe that no material change should be made in the methods now followed. However, I believe that it would be to the advantage of most student officers to have more lectures during the first period of the course (2 or 3 weeks) by officers of the General Staff, office of the Assistant Secretary of War and the Chiefs of the several supply branches. These lectures should cover in general an outline of the missions of these various branches and should not take up special plans for the procurement of commodities or materials, but are to give the student officers a general view of the rations and missions of the various branches of the War Department. My chief reason for making this suggestion is due to the impression that I obtained from reading the various books and pamphlets which were given as references for the orientation course. This line of reading in general relates to methods of procurement that were used in the World War and I believe that many of the students will fail to grasp the fact that conditions in the next war will be materially different from those which existed in 1917 and 1918. This should be pointed out to the students and their attention especially called to the following conditions which will probably differ:

No plans for procurement had been made by any of the supply branches.

There was no assistance such as the Assistant Secretary's office for coordinating and directing the efforts of these supply branches.

There was no general mobilization plan and the supply branches could not obtain any information as to what their plans would be and what they would be expected to furnish. We were entering a war which had been underway for more than 3 years and we had been furnishing an enormous quantity of munitions most of the period of this war. None of the supply branches had the figures as to requirements and very few specifications.

The country in general had no conception as to what would be required in a great struggle and there had never been an occasion where it had been necessary to coordinate the efforts of the whole country.

All these conditions above mentioned were very important factors affecting the methods which were employed in 1917 and 1918 and none of them will obtain in a future war.

The course of reading as outlined is very instructive and beneficial but the student officer should, in my opinion, have their attention called to the radical changes in conditions so that the tendency to judge the future by the past will not lead them so far astray. While it is true

that the past is the best guide for forming an opinion of the future, it is very important that the changed conditions shall be fully considered. If this is not the case, a plan of action formed on past experience will certainly be far from the correct solution unless changed conditions are constantly kept in mind."

Lt.Col. C.C. Whitcomb, M.C.

-oOo-

"It is thought highly desirable that the importance of tact, consideration of the business man's point of view and the art of speaking his language be impressed upon officers connected with industrial supply work."

Lt.Col. R. T. Ellis, Q.M.C.

-oOo-

"The student would "get his feet on the ground" in a much shorter time if the first month of the course were devoted to daily lectures and conferences on the subjects covered by the first three problems, (Orientation). He would be able to apply the conclusions drawn therefrom in his individual studies and in the solving of problems. Lectures such as General Conner's, should be scheduled early in the course, as the information imparted would materially assist the student in his work."

Lt. Col. C. R. Reese, Q.M.C.

-oOo-

"Having never before had formal study or duty of this kind, I scarcely feel competent to offer any suggestions or constructive criticism. Nevertheless the following comment is submitted:

It seems to me that somewhat greater emphasis should be placed upon "orientation". In addition to the assignment of authoritative books and papers for study, a series of lectures in the opening period should be given by the Assistant Secretary of War, by the chiefs of the supply branches and by officers of the General Staff. Prior to his beginning work on the individual and committee problems of the course, each student officer should be indoctrinated with a clear-cut conception of the missions and policies of the War Department and of the several supply services. Intensive instruction of this kind would be of greatest value. At the outset - to drop into the vernacular - I think that "orientation" should be something "handed out" to the student rather than something to be "dug out" by him. Later on in the course, in working on problems, he will have opportunity to formulate and to express his own coinciding or differing conclusions."

Cmdr. L.W. Jennings, S.C., U.S.N.

-oOo-

"That the orientation course be conducted through well chosen lectures rather than by individual study. The faculty knows what basic knowledge is required to comprehend the specific problems of the course and can fit the student to meet these problems better than he can himself."

Maj. L. B. McAfee, M.C.

-oOo-

"At the beginning of the present course I found difficulty in orientating myself and knowing "just what it was all about", and feel that any succeeding course would be bettered by devoting the first week to a series of lectures by the Commandant of the School, the Assistant Secretary of War, the Chief of the G-4 section of the General Staff, the Chief Co-ordination, etc., each one giving a word picture of the functions of his office. These talks would give the students an excellent idea of the inter-relations of the functions of the several offices interested in "supply matters".

Maj. S. W. Fitzgerald, A.S.

"It is recommended that future courses be improved by including in the Orientation course given at the beginning lectures by the following officers:
Assistant Secretary of War, or Director of Procurement.
G-6, War Dept. Gen. Staff.
Each chief of supply branches.
Chief coordinators"

Maj. R. L. Maxwell, Ord.

-oOo-

"Much valuable time may be saved to officers not familiar with the war time ramifications of the Government in its relations with industry if, as each subject is taken up for study, a member of the faculty, officer on duty in the Planning Branch, or civilian adviser, would give the class at least the general historical background. For example, I think Mr. Gifford's lecture would have been of greater value in giving the class a picture of the early war time set up had it come at the very beginning of the course. Likewise, before a line was written on labor, it would have been a fine thing to have heard Mr. Green or other representatives of the Amer. Fed. of Labor."

Maj. J. L. Frink, Q.M.C.

*oOo-

FACULTY COMMENT:

The need of an adequate orientation is evident. See remarks in Faculty report proper.

-oOo-

LECTURES:

"It is desired to stress the importance and value of having talks to the class by leaders in various industries and enterprises which past experience has taught us are of importance in an emergency.

A talk by some qualified financier on the various methods by which individuals and corporations obtain the necessary funds to conduct large enterprises is believed would prove of great benefit.

The present class has had the opportunity of hearing the President of the American Federation of Labor indicate the position of organized labor and what action it would undoubtedly take in case of emergency.

If one or more business men, who have had experience in handling labor in all its various phases, could be induced to talk frankly on the labor problems which confronted them during the war and to give their recommendations in case of future emergency, it would be valuable.

The subject of labor is an extremely important one. The average army officer's conception of its intricacies and all its intimate relations is believed to be rather vague.

In view of the fact that officers who have taken the course at this college may eventually be detailed where their duties will bring them into close contact with representative business men throughout the country, it might be well to have a talk from a representative from one of the large insurance companies or advertising concerns on what might be termed for want of a better designation, the "psychology of approach".

Lt.Col. R. T. Ellis, Q.M.C.

-oOo-

"I suggest that the chief of each supply branch lecture once during each course. This will tend to bring the branches in close touch with the college and impress the class with the relation of the chief to the college."

Lt.Col. W.C. Baker, C.W.S.

-oOo-

"That the chiefs of the supply branches or their representatives be called upon for lectures early in the course in order that the student may become acquainted with their individual supply problems and apply such information or at least be guided by it in subsequent committee studies."

Maj. L. B. McAfee, M.C.

-oOo-

"More lectures by representatives of the procurement branches on the methods employed in computing requirements and preparation of procurement plans would give the students a better understanding of the intricate problems with which each supply branch is confronted in these matters."

Maj. R.W. Riefkohl, Q.M.C.

-oOo-

214

"Concerning lectures, I do not believe that we make sufficient use of brilliant speakers like Col. Frank Scott, Ord-^{es.} Col. Scott would probably be willing to give two or three prepared lectures on each visit to the College. Others of like ability would probable also agree to give prepared lectures. If a group of, say ten men, of this type were secured, each lecturing on specifically assigned subjects, a series of feature lectures spread over the year and similar to the well considered addresses given at the War College would result. With judicious publicity, the lectures could also bring the Industrial College into the public eye."

Capt. E.E. MacMorland, Ord.

-oOo-

FACULTY COMMENT:

The number of lectures from sources outside of the War Department will be increased for future courses.

-oOo-

COMMODITY STUDIES:

"The commodity study with which the present course ended - except as to the War Game - can, I believe, be issued a full two months earlier. They can be made very valuable for actual procurement planning, but not to a great extent with but two weeks research."

Capt. E. Snow, C.C., U.S.N.

-oOo-

"The War Game impressed me with the fact that all commodity studies should be made with a view of anticipating the questions which a commodity committee may have to answer in a hurry in war time. There should be standardized and all information not pertinent should be omitted; as an example, I find that in one commodity study by a supply branch imports and consumption, as well as quantities manufactured into various articles, are quoted in terms of dollars. This does help much since the interesting thing to know is how much of this commodity is used in each division of industry. Commodity studies are frequently incomplete in pertinent information."

Maj. R. W. Riefkohl, Q.M.C.

-oOo-

"The problems pertaining to organization, commodities and war plan procurement have been extremely interesting. The only criticism on these would be that the commodity study be given more time - to be carried along with the other problems - if need be, that more reading can be done on the commodity for as thorough an understanding as possible of the subject."²

Maj. H. F. Cameron, C.E.

-oOo-

FACULTY COMMENT:

Commodity studies are made in the College only for the purpose of impressing on the students' minds the magnitude of such tasks, the effective methods of approach and some idea of sources of data. A real commodity study requires a long period of work on the part of one who is an expert along the lines of the study.

-oOo-

PROBLEMS:

"In my opinion too much time is allotted to some of the committee problems. I have observed that often the solution of the problem is complete and written up several days before the time limit. This is due, partly, to the uncertainty of getting necessary clerical assistance to typewrite the solution."

Capt. J.R. Defrees, U.S.N.

-oOo-

"That the statement of each problem be drafted so that there is a closer apparent relation between the "object" and what is "required". That for the next class a problem of two weeks duration be drafted to obtain individual remarks tending toward improvement of the Procurement Manual."

Maj. Fred Seydel, C.W.S.

-oOo-

FACULTY COMMENT:

No comment.

-oOo-

COMMITTEES:

"The question as to the relative instructional value of problems worked on individually as against collective work by Committee has undoubtedly been raised more than once. From a student's point of view, I am inclined to favor individual work. However, when working on real and constructive problems, such as the Problem No. 5, this current year (Procurement Manual) committee work is required."

Capt. E. Snow, C.C., U.S.N.

-oOo-

"It is also my opinion that the committees, as a general rule, are too large and should be limited to three members. As a general rule, one or two members of the committee do the work for the whole committee. The others assist only at conferences."

Capt. J. R. Defrees, U.S.N.

-cOo-

"Generally, for problems handled by the committees, the time allotted is more than is necessary.

Not to exceed four members on a committee is, I believe, sufficient for the best results."

Lt. Col. R.T. Ellis, Q.M.C.

-cOo-

"Personal contact will always accomplish results more satisfactorily than correspondence. For this reason every effort should be made to rotate officers so that each officer gets a chance to serve on a committee with another officer. I have been on several committees with the same officers and have not been on a committee with others. This school

offers a chance for a man to become well acquainted with two to four officers from each of the other branches. Mutual acquaintance and respect will go a long way to break down branch jealousies which now exist."

Maj. C. A. Schimelfenig, Ord.

-cOo-

"In the case of debatable problems, such as Interbureau Procurement, Super-agencies, etc., two should be formed for each problem and these two committees should be instructed to present the affirmative and negative side of the case, respectively."

Lt. H. W. Rowan, C.W.S.

-cOo-

FACULTY COMMENT:

Committee work is effective when the Chairman understands how to allocate work to the members of the committee and correlate their efforts along constructive lines. Effort has been made to rotate committee membership so far as time schedules would permit. The troubles mentioned in the main can be cured by the exercise of more control over the committee."

-cOo-

WAR GAME:

"Two war games should be played by the class, one in the middle of the course and one at its completion."

Maj. I. A. Rader, A.S.

-cOo-

217

"More time should be devoted to this exercise as it is believed that the situations and discussions give the student a better understanding of the scope and importance of the procurement problems which will come up in time of war."

Maj. R. W. Riefkohl, Q.M.C.

-oOo-

FACULTY COMMENT:

No comment.

-oOo-

RELATIONS WITH GENERAL STAFF AND WAR COLLEGE:

"The business of fighting wars is, in the last analysis, based on cooperation. Procurement and supply branches will always be dependent on the decisions reached by the War Department General Staff. There are many decisions made which are of vital concern to the branches. Some of these might properly have been made by the Assistant Secretary of War. Many are made in the shadow zone between the duties of the General Staff and the Assistant Secretary of War. The line of demarcation can only be drawn after conference and with mutual respect for each other's functions. Therefore, students of this college should be taught the proper functions of the General Staff as well as of the Assistant Secretary of War. I would suggest a course of a week or ten days on the duties of the General Staff. This could be conducted with the assistance of the General Staff. Particular attention should be paid to the work of G-4."

Maj. C. A. Schimelfenig, Ord.

-oOo-

"More lectures should be given by representatives from the General Staff; representatives from G-1, G-2 and G-3, as well as from G-4, should give at least one lecture so that the class would have an opportunity to learn their problems and how they propose to solve them."

Maj. I. A. Rader, A.S.

-oOo-

"If, considering all the various angles involved, the course can be lengthened as herein suggested, it might not be a bad idea if a close liaison could be established with the War College in the matter of combined lectures on subjects of common interest."

Maj. J. L. Frink, Q.M.C.

-oOo-

FACULTY COMMENT:

The Faculty agrees with these comments in principle and will continue to develop such contacts to the greatest extent possible.

-oOo-

EXERCISE:

"That, in addition to Saturday afternoons, an afternoon be allowed for exercise."

Maj. Fred Seydel, C.W.S.

-oOo-

"While I have taken the prescribed exercise, I believe the amount required is insufficient if the student is to give the best that is in him. At least it has not been sufficient in my case.

It is therefore suggested that Wednesday afternoon, as well as Saturday afternoon, be allowed throughout the year for this purpose and that, in addition, some means be adopted to stimulate exercise in the form of tennis and indoor baseball during the noon hour.

From two to four afternoons are allowed a week for the Command and General Staff School for this purpose. I understand that Wednesday and Saturdays are allowed the War College and that games are played during the noon hour."

Maj. D. C. Cordiner, Q.M.C.

-oOo-

"Saturday afternoon is now scheduled for exercise. It would be better if some other week day were designated. The crowded condition of golf and tennis facilities on Saturday usually precludes either sport on this day."

Capt. E.E. MacMorland, Ord.

-oOo-

"It is suggested that a mid-week afternoon be assigned for exercise."

Capt. S. E. Nortner, C.E.

-oOo-

FACULTY COMMENT:

Hereafter student officers will be given Wednesday and Saturday afternoons for exercise throughout the academic year, as is now being done at the War College.

-oOo-