

Inside

Issue 59, 4th Quarter 2010

Editor Col David H. Gurney, USMC (Ret.)

Executive Editor Jeffrey D. Smotherman, Ph.D.

Supervisory Editor George C. Maerz

Production Supervisor Martin J. Peters, Jr.

Senior Copy Editor Calvin B. Kelley

Book Review Editor Lisa M. Yambrick

Visual Design Editor Tara J. Parekh

Copy Editor/Office Manager John J. Church, D.M.A.

Internet Publications Editor Joanna E. Seich

Design Jon Raedeke and Chris Dunham,

U.S. Government Printing Office

Printed in St. Louis, Missouri



NDU Press is the National Defense University's cross-component, professional military and academic publishing house. It publishes books, policy briefs, occasional papers, monographs, and special reports on national security strategy, defense policy, national military strategy, regional security affairs, and global strategic problems.

This is the authoritative, official U.S. Department of Defense edition of *JFQ*. Any copyrighted portions of this journal may not be reproduced or extracted without permission of the copyright proprietors. *Joint Force Quarterly* should be acknowledged whenever material is quoted from or based on its content.

COMMUNICATIONS

Please visit NDU Press and *Joint Force Quarterly* online at ndupress.ndu.edu for more on upcoming issues, an electronic archive of *JFQ* articles, and access to many other useful NDU Press publications. Constructive comments and contributions are important to us. Please direct editorial communications to the link on the NDU Press Web site or write to:

Editor, *Joint Force Quarterly*
National Defense University Press
260 Fifth Avenue, S.W. (Building 64, Room 2505)
Fort Lesley J. McNair
Washington, DC 20319

Telephone: (202) 685-4220/DSN 325
FAX: (202) 685-4219/DSN 325
Email: JFQ1@ndu.edu
JFQ online: ndupress.ndu.edu

4th Quarter, October 2010
ISSN 1070-0692



JFQ Dialogue

- 2 From the Chairman
- 4 Letters to the Editor

Forum

- 6 Executive Summary
- 8 An Interview with General James T. Conway, 34th Commandant of the Marine Corps
- 14 Developing an Operational Reserve: A Policy and Historical Context and the Way Forward *By John D. Winkler*
- 21 Operational for What? The Future of the Guard and Reserves *By John A. Nagl and Travis Sharp*
- 30 Senior Officer Professional Military Education as an Equalizer *By James T. Currie*

Special Feature

- 35 The Security Trinity: Understanding the Role of Security Forces in COIN *By Eric E. Greek*
- 40 Understanding Sri Lanka's Defeat of the Tamil Tigers *By Niel A. Smith*
- 45 ISAF and Afghanistan: The Impact of Failure on NATO's Future *By Tarn D. Warren*
- 52 A QDR for All Seasons? The Pentagon Is Not Preparing for the Most Likely Conflicts *By Roy Godson and Richard H. Shultz, Jr.*
- 57 Is the Conduct of War a Business? *By Milan Vejo*

Essay Contests

- 66 Winners of the 2010 Writing Competitions
- 68 Harmonious Ocean? Chinese Aircraft Carriers and the Australia-U.S. Alliance *By John Frewen*
- 75 U.S. Strategy in Afghanistan: Flawed Assumptions Will Lead to Ultimate Failure *By Mark Schrecker*
- 83 Information Strategy: The Missing Link *By Hans F. Palaoro*

Commentary

- 86 Ike Warned Us About This: The MICC Stranglehold on Responsible Procurement *By Eric A. Hollister*
- 94 Redress of Professional Military Education: The Clarion Call *By Charles D. Allen*
- 101 Breaking Ranks: Dissent and the Military Professional *By Andrew R. Milburn*
- 108 Building a Potemkin Village: A Taliban Strategy to Reclaim the Homeland *By Jeff Donnithorne*
- 110 Strategic Communication in the New Media Sphere *By Timothy Cunningham*



JFQ

Features

- 115** What U.S. Cyber Command Must Do *By Wesley R. Andruess*
- 121** China's Ace in the Hole: Rare Earth Elements *By Cindy A. Hurst*
- 127** Responsible Drawdown: Synchronizing the Joint Vision
By Paul C. Hurley and John J. Abbatiello
- 136** Force Planning in the 2010 QDR *By Kathleen H. Hicks and Samuel J. Brannen*

Force of Law

- 143** A Patchwork Strategy of Consensus: Establishing Rule of Law in Afghanistan
By Mark R. Hagerott, Thomas J. Umberg, and Joseph A. Jackson

Recall

- 147** Operation Albion and Joint Amphibious Doctrine *By Gregory A. Thiele*

Book Reviews

- 152** The Art of Command: Military Leadership from George Washington to Colin Powell *Reviewed by Rizwan Ali*
- 153** Will Terrorists Go Nuclear? *Reviewed by John D. Becker*
- 154** Intelligence for an Age of Terror *Reviewed by Clark Capshaw*
- 155** Immortal: A Military History of Iran and Its Armed Forces
Reviewed by Todd M. Manyx

Joint Doctrine

- 156** Redefining the Center of Gravity *By Dale C. Eikmeier*
- 159** ALSA: Increasing Warfighter Interoperability *By Ray A. Zuniga*
- 160** Joint Doctrine Update

PUBLISHER

ADM Michael G. Mullen, USN

PRESIDENT, NDU

VADM Ann E. Rondeau, USN

ADVISORY COMMITTEE

LTG Lloyd J. Austin III, USA *The Joint Staff*
 AMB Joyce A. Barr *Industrial College of the Armed Forces*
 Gen James E. Cartwright, USMC *The Joint Staff*
 LTG Robert L. Caslen, USA *U.S. Army Command and General Staff College*
 LtGen George J. Flynn, USMC *USMC Combat Development Command*
 Maj Gen Robert C. Kane, USAF *Air War College*
 RADM Douglas J. McAneny, USN *National War College*
 John A. Nagl *Center for a New American Security*
 MajGen Robert B. Neller, USMC *Marine Corps War College*
 VADM Daniel T. Oliver, USN (Ret.) *Naval Postgraduate School*
 LtGen John M. Paxton, Jr., USMC *The Joint Staff*
 Brig Gen Anthony J. Rock, Jr., USAF *Air Command and Staff College*
 Brig Gen Marvin T. Smoot, USAF *Joint Forces Staff College*
 ADM James G. Stavridis, USN *U.S. European Command*
 RADM James P. Wisecup, USN *Naval War College*

EDITORIAL BOARD

Richard K. Betts *Columbia University*
 Stephen D. Chiabotti *School of Advanced Air and Space Studies*
 Eliot A. Cohen *The Johns Hopkins University*
 COL Joseph J. Collins, USA (Ret.) *National War College*
 Mark J. Conversino *Air War College*
 Aaron L. Friedberg *Princeton University*
 Col Thomas C. Greenwood, USMC (Ret.) *Institute for Defense Analyses*
 Alan L. Gropman *Industrial College of the Armed Forces*
 Douglas N. Hime *Naval War College*
 Mark H. Jacobsen *Marine Corps Command and Staff College*
 CAPT John F. Kirby, USN *The Joint Staff*
 Daniel T. Kuehl *Information Resources Management College*
 Col Jerome M. Lynes, USMC (Ret.) *The Joint Staff*
 Thomas L. McNaughter *The RAND Corporation*
 Kathleen Mahoney-Norris *Air Command and Staff College*
 Col Mark Pizzo, USMC (Ret.) *National War College*
 James A. Scheer *Office of the Secretary of Defense*
 LtGen Bernard E. Trainor, USMC (Ret.)

CONTRIBUTIONS

Joint Force Quarterly welcomes submission of scholarly, independent research from members of the Armed Forces, security policymakers and shapers, defense analysts, academic specialists, and civilians from the United States and abroad. Submit articles for consideration to the address on the opposite page or by email to JFQ1@ndu.edu "Attention A&R Editor" in the subject line. For further information, see the guidelines on the NDU Press Web site at ndupress.ndu.edu.

Joint Force Quarterly is published by the National Defense University Press for the Chairman of the Joint Chiefs of Staff. *JFQ* is the Chairman's flagship joint military and security studies journal designed to inform members of the U.S. Armed Forces, allies, and other partners on joint and integrated operations; national security policy and strategy; efforts to combat terrorism; homeland security; and developments in training and joint professional military education to transform America's military and security apparatus to meet tomorrow's challenges better while protecting freedom today.

The opinions, conclusions, and recommendations expressed or implied within are those of the contributors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the Department of Defense or any other agency of the Federal Government.

ndupress.ndu.edu



ABOUT THE COVERS

Front cover: Colorado National Guardsman performs combat hoist training from UH-60 Black Hawk helicopter in Herat Province, Afghanistan (U.S. Air Force/Rasheen A. Douglas). Table of contents (left to right): Inactive Ready Reserve Soldier, a veteran of Operation *Iraqi Freedom*, operates in Afghanistan, Afghanistan (U.S. Army/Teddy Wade); Air Force Reserve Airmen load AIM-9 Sidewinder missile on F-16 (U.S. Air Force/Larry E. Reid, Jr.); Joint National Guard F-16 taxis for takeoff on alert mission from Joint Base Balad, Iraq (U.S. Air Force/Cayce Cook); and Commander, U.S. Army Training and Doctrine Command, speaks on importance of staying current on modern technology (U.S. Army/Jane Armstrong).